



## Radiochemistry Webinars

Separation of Xenon and Krypton from nuclear reprocessing using Open Framework Materials



#### **Meet the Presenter...**

Dr. Praveen K. Thallapally is a chief scientist at the Pacific Northwest National Laboratory. He obtained his PhD in 2003 from the University of Hyderabad working with Prof. Gautam R. Desiraju in the area of Crystal Engineering of organic and metal organic solids. He moved to the University of Missouri Columbia as a post-doctoral fellow working with Prof. Jerry L. Atwood in the area of supramolecular chemistry, gas storage and separation. He leads research efforts in the design of porous materials for energy conversion, catalysis, immobilization of radionuclides and electro-optic responsive metal organic frameworks . He published more than 120 research articles with an H-index of 45. He s is an advisory board member for Crystal Growth & Design, CrystEngComm and Journal of Coordination Chemistry.

Dr. Praveen Thallapally

Email: Praveen.Thallapally@pnnl.gov



#### **Acknowledgements**

#### Interns, Postdocs and Co-workers

Mr. Paul Reiss (Intern, UK), Dr. Carlos

Fernandez, Todd Schaef, Dr. Nune Satish



Not shown







4Â...ÈĿ³.\*Á ¿ÄÄ/22 ÈÂÅ





BNL NSLS-II



ANL - Adv photon source



Dr. Denis Strachan & Dr. Pete McGrail,

**PNNL** 

Dr. Troy Garn, Dr. Mitch Greenhalgh & Dr. Amy K. Welty (not shown), INL

Prof. Brian Space, USA (not shown) Prof. Maciej Haranczyk, Berkeley

Prof. Wen Zhang, China

**Collaborators:** 

Prof. Smith, Prof. Atwood Moises

Prof. Zaworotko

UK

Berkeley Columbia, MO Ireland Advise:









Prof. Parise Prof.

USA







## Outline

- Definitions
- History of Xenon and Krypton
- Nuclear re-processing
- Porous materials Metal organic frameworks
- Synthesis and characterization
- Adsorption and separation
- Conclusion
- Questions?

**Porous/Pores:** Tiny spaces or holes through which liquid or gas molecules penetrate (ultramicropore < 0.5 nm, micropore >0.5 - 2 nm, mesopore 2 - 5 nm, or macropore >5nm)

Van der Waals Forces: When two atoms come close to each other, a slight interaction between them causing polarity and slight attraction



**Electrostatic Attraction or Hydrogen bonding:** attraction between two polar groups when hydrogen atom covalently bound to a highly electronegative atom



#### Hydrogen bonding strength

- F-H…:F (38.0 kcal/mol)
- O-H…:N (6.0 kcal/mol)
- O-H…:O (5.0 kcal/mol)
- N-H…:N (3.1 kcal/mol)
- N-H…:O (1.9 kcal/mol)

**Coordination complex** in which each metal atom connected to multiple molecules or ligands depending on their coordination number



**Adsorption:** is phenomenon in which gas/liquid molecules are attached to solid surface by intermolecular interactions

**Physical adsorption:** attached to solid surface by weaker interactions between solid and gas/liquid



Chemical Adsorption: Stronger interactions between the solid and gas/liquid



**Desorption** in which the adsorbed gas/liquid released from the surface by heating or vacuum.

Adsorption isotherm: a graph between the amount of gas/vapor adsorbed on a solid and pressure at constant temperature.



Breakthrough plot

## History of Xenon and Krypton

- Xenon and Krypton discovered by Sir William Ramsay and Morris Travers 1898
- Xenon and Krypton are odorless, colorless, tasteless and chemically non reactive
- ✓ In 1962 Neil Bartlett discovered Xe and Kr will react with fluorine to form fluorine derivatives.

Х	e	n	0	n
	_			

#### **Krypton**

Atomic	54	Atomic number	36
number		Atomic mass	83.80 g. mol <sup>-1</sup>
Atomic mass	131.29 g.mol <sup>-1</sup>	<b>D</b>	3.73 10 <sup>-3</sup> g. cm <sup>-3</sup> at
Density	5.9 x10 <sup>-3</sup> g.cm <sup>-3</sup> at	Density Melting point	20°C
	20°C		- 157 °C
Melting point	- 112 °C	Boiling point	- 153° C
<b>Boiling point</b> Diameter	- 107 °C 0.4 nm	Diameter	0.36 nm

## Source of Xenon and Krypton

- Xenon and Krypton occur naturally in the atmosphere at 0.087 ppmv (Xe) and 114 ppm (Kr)
- > Xe has nine and Kr has six naturally occurring stable isotopes.

#### **Radioactive Xe and Kr**

- Fission of uranium, plutonium or other radioactive decay of fission products
- Production of medical isotopes
- Nuclear accidents Fukushima Daiichi Nuclear Power Plant in Japan
- Dissolution of the spent fuel in nuclear reprocessing
- Radioactive Xe isotopes are monitored around the globe to detect nuclear explosions
- These systems detected and tracked Xe isotopes from the Japanese nuclear accident

## Statistic on spent fuel

- Spent fuel is a nuclear fuel that is irradiated in the nuclear reactor
- Love It or Hate It We Have It: What to do with It is the Issue
- We have about 70,000 tonnes
- Current reactors will produce 60,000 tonnes more over their lifetimes

#### Nuclear Waste Legacy (EM, NE) for USA and the world



Elements, Dec 2006



#### Reprocessing the spent fuel

- ✓ Spent fuel can be reprocessed to recover fissile and fertile materials to provide fresh fuel to new and existing nuclear plants saving up to 30% of the natural uranium otherwise required
- Reduce the volume of material to be disposed of as high-level waste to about one-fifth
- ✓ In addition, the level of radioactivity in the waste from reprocessing is much smaller compared to before reprocessing



## Reprocessing flow diagram



## Separations and applications

- Capture of Xe provides an economic incentive
- High purity of Xe
  - Buildings Commercial lighting
  - Automotive Head lights
  - Space Industry Propellant
  - Medical Anesthesia, Imaging
  - Science NMR
- High Purity of Kr
  - Insulation Efficiency is 6 times higher than normal windows
  - Flat panel display manufacturing





#### Objectives and existing technologies

- Objective: The objective is to develop and test alternative materials to capture volatile radioactive gas components (most specifically Kr) released during Used Nuclear Fuel Reprocessing operations
- Existing Technology
  - Cryogenic distillation to remove Xe and Kr
    - Projected to be expensive
    - Potential to accumulate O<sub>3</sub> due to radiolysis of O<sub>2</sub> ⇒ Explosion hazardous
- Immobilization
  - Elevated pressure in a stainless steel canisters
  - <sup>85</sup>Kr decay product Rb is a liquid at storage temperatures
  - Corrosive to storage canisters



\$5,000 per kilogram

#### Alternate materials/methods

#### Porous Materials

- Separation at higher temperatures
- Remove Xe and Kr in separate steps
- Remove Xe at ambient temperature Recover process costs by selling Xe?
- Remove Kr at near room temperature
- Porous Materials allow
  - More gas to be stored in the canister at lower pressures
  - The decay product Rb would be isolated from the metal canister
  - Porous materials have capacities 3 to 10 times those of currently used materials. For eg.  $CO_2$ ,  $H_2$  and Natural gas



Thallapally et. al., Chem Commun., 2013

#### Porous materials

#### Organic Solids Organic





Thallapally et. al., Angew. Chem., 2005 Thallapally et. al., J. Am. Soc. Chem., 2006 Thallapally et. al., Angew Chem., 2006 Thallapally et. al., J. Am. Chem. Soc. 2007 Thallapally et. al., Chem. Mat., 2007 Thallapally et. al., Nature Materials, 2008 Thallapally et. al., Angew Chem., 2009 Thallapally et. al., J. Am. Chem. Soc., 2009 Thallapally et. al., Chem Comm. 2010 Thallapally et. al., Chem Comm., 2010 Thallapally et. al., Chem Comm., 2010 Thallapally et. al., Chem Comm., 2012 Prussian Blue/Zeolites Inorganic



Windisch et. al., Spe. Chem. 2009 Windisch et. al., Spe. Chem. 2010 Thallapally et. al., Inorg. Chem., 2010 Thallapally et. al., Cryst. Eng. Comm., 2010 MOF's/COFs Hybrid



Thallapally et. al., Cryst Grow. Des, 2002 McKinley et. al., Angew Chem., 2005 McKinley et. al., Chem. Comm., 2006 Thallapally et. al., J. Am. Chem. Soc. 2008 Thallapally et. al., Inorg. Chem., 2009 Thallapally et. al., Chem. Comm., 2010 Thallapally et. al., Chem. Comm., 2010 Thallapally et. al., Chem. Comm., 2010 Thallapally et. al., Chem Comm., 2011 Harvey et. al., J. Sep. Sci. 2011 Thallapally et. al., J. Am. Chem. Soc., 2012 Thallapally et. al., J. Am. Chem. Soc., 2012 Burd et. al., J. Am. Chem. Soc., 2012 Thallapally et. al., J. Physc. Chem. C., 2012 Wang et. al., Chem. Mat., 2013

#### Concept



## Organic Solids 101 Design Principles





✓ The use of multiple metal ions in a cluster bridged by multiple coordinating ligands tends to enhance the robustness of the MOF

#### **Advantages**

- MOFs are hybrid crystalline porous solids with a vast array of topologies constructed from metal ion clusters and organic linkers.
- More than 20,000 MOF structures are known to date
- The properties of MOFs are easier to tune synthetically than those of other porous compounds
- The MOF structures are controllable to certain degree by the choice of molecular building blocks



Yaghi et. al., Science 2013, 974; Kitagawa et. al., Angew Chem. 2002; Ferey et. al., Science 2002

#### Advantages and disadvantages

- Long cycle stability 500 2000
- More than 5,000 experimental and 130,000 hypothetical MOF structures are known to date
- Possess much higher specific surface area (~8,000 m<sup>2</sup>/g) than possible in any other traditional crystalline material

#### **Disadvantages**

- Stability 300 900°C
- Limited quantities



## Synthesis protocol

- MOFs are constructed from precursor chemicals that in most cases are readily available
- Mild synthesis conditions provide options for in-house production as desired
- MOFs can be made in many different forms as needed:
  - Bulk powders
  - Nanoparticles
  - Fibers
  - Gels









Stock, N., Chem. Rev., 2012, 112 (2), pp 933-969

#### Batch process



## Physical and chemical properties

Gas composition in nuclear re-processing plants



Thallapally. et. al., Acc. Chem. Res., 48, 211, 2015

#### Ideal adsorbent



## Types of MOFs studied

- 1. MOF-5, a proto-type
- 2. MOFs functionalized with polar groups
- 3. MOFs containing open metal sites
- Hydrophobic MOFs with small pore size
- MOFs impregnated with Ag<sup>0</sup> nano particles





Thallapally et. al., Chem. Comm., 2012, 48, 347

Thallapally et. al., J. Am. Chem. Soc., 137, 7007, 2015



Thallapally, Cooper et. al., Nature Materials., 13, 954, 2014

- Role of surface area
- Open metal sites
- Small pores/polar groups
- ➤ Nanoparticles



Thallapally et. al., J. Am. Chem. Soc., 134, 9046, 2012

## MOF-5 synthesis and characterization



Mol For:  $Zn_4O(BDC)_3$ 



Xtal/particle morphology



28

3D Structure



Yaghi et. al., Science 2002

#### Synthesis of a Mdobdc family of MOFs



Yaghi et. al., PNAS., 2006 Thallpally et. al., J. Physc. Chem. C. 116, 9575, 2012.

#### Characterization of Mdobdc MOF



- Identical PXRD indicate the successful synthesis and identical topology
- Thermogravimetric analysis indicate ~30% of weight loss between RT to 250 °C
- 1200 m<sup>2</sup>/g surface area



#### Mdobdc family of MOFs



Matzger and co-workers., J. Am. Chem. Soc., 2008 Thallapally et. al., J. Physc. Chem. C., 2012

#### Gravimetric gas analyzer







 $\bullet$  Pressure/gas composition changed and held constant to set point  $P_{\rm n}$ 

• Weight data is acquired and analyzed in real time to determine the equilibrium uptake

•Equilibrium points are collected and plotted as an isotherm

## What about Xenon and Krypton MOF -5 Vs Nidobdc



#### 34

#### Nidobdc MOF

- Corresponds to seven Xe per cavity.
- Highly selective to Xe over Kr, N<sub>2</sub>
- The only mechanism for Xenon to interact is based on its polarizability.
- Metal cations are very polarizing, which may enhance the interaction with polarizable adsorbents
- Additionally, high surface area, uniform porosity, and high diffusivity make NiDOBDC more attractive.
- The ability to tune the properties by replacing nickel with another transition metal center (Mg, Co, Zn and Mn) is advantageous compared to other materials



#### In-situ XRD on Nidobdc with Xe/Kr flow NSLS/PETRA III



## Breakthrough measurements apparatus



#### Table 1. Properties of the Ni/DOBDC Pellet

property	value
pressed pressure	12 MPa
size	600–850 μm
pellet density	$0.78 \text{ g/cm}^3$
packing density	0.40 g/cm <sup>3</sup>
BET surface area	1147 m <sup>2</sup> /g
original weight	1.51 g
activated weight	1.01 g



36

Thallapally et. al., Langmuir 2012, 28, 11584

## Nidobdc pellet characterization



PXRD confirms the crystallinity of the sample

- No amorphization of upon pressurization
- Reduced surface area of the pellets compare to powder
- Uptake of Xe/Kr using breakthrough matches with static method

Thallapally et. al., Langmuir 2012, 28, 11584



#### Single column experiments with off-gas mixture



Air = 400 ppm Xe, 40 ppm Kr, 78%  $N_2$ , 21%  $O_2$ , 0.9% Ar, 0.03%  $CO_2$  etc

- He flow rate and the flow rate of Xe and Kr in air is 20 sccm.
- NiDOBDC adsorbs Xenon preferentially over

other gases

>95% of Xenon is captured from air using

NIDOBDC

- •Ni/DOBDC is able to separate 400 ppm Xe from 40 ppm Kr mixture in air with a Xe/Kr overall selectivity of 7.3.
- •The uniform cylindrical pores are believed to be favorable to maximize the Xe/Ke selectivity

Thallapally et. al., Langmuir 2012, 28, 11584

#### Two-column breakthrough experiments with off-gas mixture

Air = 400 ppm Xe, 40 ppm Kr, 78%  $N_2, \, 21\% \, O_2, \, 0.9\%$  Ar, 0.03%  $CO_2 \, etc$ 

- A two-bed technique to remove and separate
  - Bed 1 remove Xe from air
    - NIDOBDC MOF
    - Yields air with Kr
  - Bed 2 remove Kr
    - Yields air without Xe and Kr
    - Off-gas can be released

#### Results

- Air: 400 ppmV Xe, 40 ppmV Kr
- Removal of Xe first (Bed 1) removes competition on Bed 2
- NiDOBDC capacity
  - 0.24 mmol/kg w/ Xe
  - 0.61 mmol/kg w/o Xe



#### Effect of $\gamma$ radiation (<sup>60</sup>Co)

The goal is to deliver the same amount of radiation exposure to the material using <sup>60</sup>Co as would be delivered by the <sup>85</sup>Kr
Needed 1.4 × 10<sup>13</sup> R
Max about 7 × 10<sup>6</sup> R



This view shows the distance between the source and the collimator



	Dose rate 40000 R/h	
Sample	Dose	Days
1	960 000	1
2	1920 000	2
3	3840 000	4
4	6720 000	7

# Surface area measurement on radiation irradiated samples



#### Xenon and Krypton loading



- Slightly reduced Xe/Kr at 1 bar and RT
- Might be due to the 10% of impurity (Nickel formate) in the samples studied
- Nickel formate was confirmed from the XRD powder patterns.

#### Techno economic evaluation of MOF-based separation

Techno-economic considerations for noble gas capture from UNF processing

Process	Decontamination Factor	Total Project Capital (\$10 <sup>6</sup> )	Proposed Annual Consumables <sup>A</sup> (\$)
Cryogenic Distillation	67	8.77	<b>267,000</b> <sup>A</sup>
MOF Adsorption	100 <sup>B</sup>	8.42	78,000

A: Includes compressor/pump utility loads adjusted to capacity factor and \$0.10/kWh, and annual consumables (hydrogen for cryogenic and MOF for the adsorbent process).

B: The MOF DF is theoretical and neither measured nor calculated. The model assumed complete adsorption based on experimental data and performance criteria established in bench scale testing.

#### □ Improve Xe/Kr adsorption at room temperature

□ Selectivity

Impregnation of silver nanoparticles in Nidobdc



Thallapally et. al., Chem. Commun., 2013

## Elemental mapping of Ag@Nidobdc



a) SEM image NiDOBDC; b) Ni; c) O; d) Ag

#### Powder X-ray Diffraction of Ag@NiDOBDC



## Ag@Nidobdc X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy



Sample	Surface area	Ag loading	
	(m <sup>2</sup> /g)	(%)	
Ni/DOBDC	781.5	0	
Ni/DOBDC-0005	749.7	1.47	
Ni/DOBDC-001	463.9	1.92	
Ni/DOBDC-01	269.9	6.59	

#### Surface area of Ag@Nidobdc



#### Xe/Kr adsorption in Ag@Nidobdc



## Types of MOFs studied

- 1. MOF-5, a proto-type
- 2. MOFs containing open metal sites
- 3. MOFs functionalized with polar groups
- MOFs impregnated with Ag<sup>0</sup> nano 4. particles
- 5. Hydrophobic MOFs with small pore size
- 6. Computational approach



Thallapally, Cooper et. al., Nature Materials., 13, 954, 2014

- Synthesis and Characterization
- Gas sorption properties at 1 bar and various temperatures
- Breakthrough measurements
- ➤ Economic analysis



2012, 48, 347

Increase in Xe/Kr capacity and selectivity at RT



Thallapally et. al., Chem. Comm., Thallapally et. al., J. Am. Chem. Soc., 137, 7007, 2015 Thallapally et. al., JACS 2012



Thallapally et. al., J. Am. Chem. Soc., 134, 9046, 2012 Thallapally et. al., Angew Chem. Int. Ed., 2016

#### Material discovery using computational approach



Thallapally et. al., Nature Communication, 2016

In Collaboration with Prof. Berend Smit @ University of Berkeley, CA

#### Leading MOF material @ RT?



#### Thermal analysis and gas adsorption



## A rare example of computationally inspired material discovery





- Based on SXRD, it is evident that –phenyl rings turned by 45° to each other as a result blocks the pore when activated at 290 C
- $\blacktriangleright$  Due to the ring rotation, the pore size in SBMOF-1 activated at 290 C is less than optimal for Xe atom to fit.
- $\blacktriangleright$  At lower pressure (~30 mbar) Xe loading is dramatic, 2.5 times more Xe uptake capacity in sample activated at low temperature

Thallapally et. al., Nature Communication, 2016

#### Other gas ads in SBMOF-1



Thallapally et. al., Nature Communication, 2016

#### Breakthrough measurements apparatus



Reduced BET surface area

# Single column breakthrough experiments on SBMOF-1 at room temperature

- Conditions
  - Air = 78% N<sub>2</sub>, 21% O<sub>2</sub>, 0.9% Ar, 0.03% CO<sub>2</sub>, 400 ppm Xe, 40 ppm Kr
  - Flow rate = 20 cm<sup>3</sup>/min
  - − T = 25 °C (298K)
  - MOF = SBMOF-1
- Results
  - SBMOF-1 adsorbs Xenon preferentially over other gases
  - Xe capacity = 15 mmol/kg vs 4.6 mmol/kg (NiMOF) and 11 mmol/kg (CC3)
  - >95% of the Xe captured from air
  - Xe/Kr (selectivity) = 15
  - Xe loading is unaffected by water (48% RH)



# Single column breakthrough experiments with 40% RH

#### Conditions

- Air = 78% N<sub>2</sub>, 21% O<sub>2</sub>, 0.9% Ar, 0.03% CO<sub>2</sub> 400 ppm Xe, 40 ppm Kr with 40% RH
- Flow rate = 20 cm<sup>3</sup>/min
- − T = 25 °C (298K)
- MOF = SBMOF-1

#### Results

- SBMOF-1 adsorbs Xenon preferentially over other gases
- Xe capacity = 14 mmol/kg
- >99% of the Xe captured from air
- Xe/Kr (selectivity) = 15
- Xe loading is unaffected by water (48% RH)



#### Two bed approach to capture Kr



## Selectivity of CaDSB or SBMOF-1



Selectivity of Gas A over B  $S_{\rm AB} = \frac{x_{\rm A}^{}/y_{\rm A}^{}}{x_{\rm B}^{}/y_{\rm B}^{}}$ 

 $x_A$  and  $x_B$  are the mole fractions of gases A and B in the adsorbed phase, and  $y_A$  and  $y_B$  are the mole fractions of gases A and B in the bulk phase,

Table 2. Co-adsorption of various gases calculated at the breakthrough point from a column containing CaSDB at room temperature. The capacity and selectivity were calculated from 20 ml/min data.

Gas	Breakthrough Time (min)	Capacity (mmol/kg)	Selectivity of Xe
Xe	18	16 (33.8) <sup>a</sup>	•
Kr	1	0.11 (0.75) <sup>a</sup>	14
CO <sub>2</sub>	5	1.2	3
$N_2$	0.08	47	209
Ar	0.08	5.28	210
$O_2$	0.08	12	206
<sup>a</sup> Capacity at equilibrium	L <sub>1</sub>		

Table 4. Co-adsorption of various gases calculated at the breakthrough point from single column breakthrough experiments containing CaSDB at room temperature with a gas mixture consisting of 130 ppm Kr, 78.2% N<sub>2</sub>, 21% O<sub>2</sub>, 0.9 Ar, and 300 ppm CO<sub>2</sub> with a flow rate of 10 ml/min.

too ppin tery rola re try are og ob tery and ooo ppin cor with a now rate of ro me minin			
Gas	Breakthrough Time (min)	Capacity (mmol/kg)	Selectivity of Kr
Kr	2.5	0.13	
CO <sub>2</sub>	7.5	0.90	0.3
$N_2$	0.25	80.8	9.9
Ar	0.25	9.09	9.3
O2	0.25	21.2	9.3

#### Kinetics and cycle experiments



- Faster kinetics, 80% of Xe adsorbed within 10 minutes
- Cycling study indicate no loss of capacity even after 20 cycles.

## Identifying Xe and Kr adsorption sites



62

• SBMOF-1 falls in the optimal pore size and shape for Xe/Kr separations, making it stand out among other MOFs.

Thallapally et. al., Nature Communication, 2016

#### CaSDB MOF vs other MOFs

6/30/2016

Selective sorbent traps xenon and krypton | Chemical & Engineering News

Volume 94 Issue 26 | p. 8 | Concentrates Issue Date: June 27, 2016

## Selective sorbent traps xenon and krypton

Porous material could be used to separate gases liberated during nuclear fuel reprocessing

By Mitch Jacoby





- ✓ SBMOF-1 is best among all other MOFs that PNNL tested at RT and nuclear re-processing condition.
- ✓ The capacity and selectivity, might be different at low temperature.

Thallapally et. al., Nature Communications, 2016

#### In conclusion

- The high capacity, selectivity and stability of MOFs allows for applications in
  - nuclear fuel reprocessing
  - pre-concentrators for sensors
- Structure Property Relationship studies combining modeling, synthesis, testing allows for a feedback loop in the design, tuning and optimization of materials
- Preferential Xe/Kr sorption from Air
- Separation of Xe and Kr in two steps as oppose to multi column distillation
- Economic Analysis suggest: RT separation of Xe/Kr is more economical than cryoseparation.





Thallapally et. al., Nature Communications, 2016

## Questions???

# Upcoming Webinars

- Iodine-129 (gaseous fission products—capture and immobilization)
- Cesium
- C-14

NAMP website http://www.wipp.energy.gov/namp